Outdoor Warning Sirens: Evaluating Communication Technologies for Reliable Emergency Notification

By Brian Nelson, Founder and Kenyon Langford, Principal, 911nurd LLC

Executive Summary

Outdoor warning sirens are essential for public safety during emergencies, ranging from severe weather to industrial accidents. This white paper compares P25, LTE (including 4G/5G), satellite, and hybrid solutions for siren activation and monitoring. Given that pure P25 systems can require tens of minutes to poll 100 or more sirens—which is unacceptable in emergency situations—this paper recommends hybrid configurations that leverage LTE's fast polling capabilities in larger environments while retaining P25's robustness as a backup, and incorporating efficient data flow to CAD systems. The option of targeted P25 deployment and satellite deployment is also explored.

Introduction

An effective outdoor warning system must promptly alert communities in emergencies. The chosen communication technology significantly influences the system's ability to rapidly activate, monitor, and receive status updates from hundreds of sirens. Traditional P25 systems, while reliable, suffer from high costs and prolonged polling times that can delay critical notifications. This paper evaluates available technologies and offers tailored recommendations to ensure that emergency notifications are delivered in seconds rather than minutes, with a focus on systems that support the necessary data exchange with CAD systems.

Communication Technologies Overview

P25

- **Strengths:**
    - Robust performance and direct device-to-device communication.
    - Low latency for voice control and interoperability among agencies.
- **Limitations:**
    - **High Cost:** Infrastructure expenses can strain municipal budgets.
    - **Extended Polling Times:** Polling 100 sirens may take roughly 20 minutes, 300 sirens around 60 minutes, and 500 sirens up to 100 minutes—delays that are unacceptable in emergencies.

    - Limited data capacity compared to modern cellular systems.
    - Slow Data return to CAD systems.

LTE / 4G / 5G

- **Strengths:**
    - Rapid data transmission and polling—notifications can be distributed within seconds.
    - Broad urban coverage and scalable performance.
    - Easy integration with IoT devices and adaptable to future cryptographic upgrades.
- **Limitations:**
    - Dependence on cellular infrastructure, which may be vulnerable during disasters.
    - Potential for network congestion during peak events.

Satellite

- **Strengths:**
    - Extensive coverage, particularly in remote or rural areas.
    - Operational independence from terrestrial infrastructure.
- **Limitations:**
    - Higher latency compared to terrestrial systems.
    - Increased operational and setup costs.

Hybrid Solutions

- **Strengths:**
    - Combines LTE's rapid polling with P25's proven reliability and satellite's wide coverage.
    - Provides multiple layers of redundancy and flexibility to suit different geographic and budgetary needs.
- **Limitations:**

- Increased complexity in system integration.
- Higher initial investment, though cost-effective in long-term performance.

Disaster Scenarios & Geographical Considerations

- **Hurricanes and Floods:**
  Coastal regions require systems that remain operational despite infrastructure damage. Hybrid solutions—integrating satellite or LTE with P25 backups—offer necessary resilience and rapid alert dissemination.
- **Tornadoes and Severe Thunderstorms:**
  Speed is critical. Systems must support near-instantaneous polling; LTE-driven solutions are preferable over P25, whose delays could prove fatal.
- **Wildfires:**
  Remote and expansive areas necessitate broad coverage. A hybrid configuration using satellite for reach and LTE for rapid polling is recommended.
- **Earthquakes:**
  Infrastructure damage is likely, so direct device-to-device communication provided by P25 is useful only when complemented by faster LTE polling for overall system responsiveness.
- **Industrial Accidents:**
  Localized emergencies require prompt activation. LTE systems, possibly with P25 backup, are best suited for these scenarios.
- **Rural vs. Urban Areas:**
  Rural areas with limited LTE coverage might rely more on satellite or P25; however, to overcome long polling delays, hybrid approaches are recommended. Urban areas benefit from extensive LTE infrastructure, making rapid polling both feasible and cost-effective.

Recommendation Matrix

The following matrix outlines recommended configurations based on the number of sirens and geographic characteristics. The matrix reflects the need for rapid polling and cost efficiency, avoiding the unacceptable delays associated with a pure P25 system.

Number of Sirens	Rural	Urban	Coastal
1 Siren	**Satellite or P25:** Use satellite for broad coverage or P25 if local reliability is prioritized. LTE may not be available.	**LTE:** Urban networks provide fast activation, efficient polling, and rapid data exchange with CAD.	**Hybrid (LTE/P25):** LTE delivers rapid notifications with P25 as a backup in case of infrastructure issues.
5 Sirens	**Hybrid (LTE with P25/Satellite Backup):** Utilize LTE for quick polling; add P25 or satellite for redundancy in areas with limited coverage.	**LTE with P25 Backup:** Prioritize LTE's rapid polling while P25 offers robust voice control in emergencies.	**Hybrid (Satellite/P25 with LTE):** LTE's speed is critical; P25 or satellite backups add resilience against coastal disruptions.
10 Sirens	**Hybrid:** Combining LTE with selective use of P25 and satellite reduces both cost and polling delays.	**LTE with P25 Backup:** Leverage LTE for near-instantaneous updates; P25 supports when needed.	**Hybrid:** An integrated system ensures fast response and resilience to coastal infrastructure challenges.
100 Sirens	**Hybrid (LTE Primary with P25/Satellite Backup):** Pure P25 is unacceptable (~20 minutes). LTE must drive the polling process for rapid alerts.	**Hybrid (LTE Primary / P25 Backup):** LTE handles the bulk of communication with P25 providing essential redundancy.	**Hybrid (LTE, P25 & Satellite):** An integrated approach ensures rapid polling and robust backup against coastal risks.
300 Sirens	**Hybrid (LTE Primary with P25/Satellite Backup):** With pure P25 taking about 60 minutes,	**Hybrid (LTE Primary / P25 Backup):** LTE's rapid polling is essential in dense	**Hybrid:** Incorporate LTE for speed, with both P25 and satellite to address the challenges of

	LTE must be the primary technology to achieve timely notifications.	urban deployments, with P25 as a backup.	extensive coastal deployments.
500 Sirens	**Hybrid (LTE Primary with P25 & Satellite Backup):** Given pure P25 polling could extend to around 100 minutes, LTE should be primary to ensure near-instantaneous updates.	**Hybrid (LTE Primary / P25 & Satellite Backup):** Prioritize LTE for its rapid communication capabilities in large urban systems.	**Hybrid (LTE, P25 & Satellite):** A comprehensive, multi-layered system is essential to ensure fast, reliable alerts along vulnerable coastal areas.

Recommendations & Implementation Strategy

Large Metropolitan Areas

Adopt a fully integrated hybrid system with LTE as the primary technology. LTE's rapid polling and data capabilities ensure emergency alerts and status updates are disseminated almost instantly. P25 and satellite backups provide redundancy to safeguard against infrastructure disruptions. Ensure robust security, especially for data flowing to the CAD system.

Medium-Sized Cities

Implement an LTE-based system supported by P25 for backup. This combination achieves the necessary speed for rapid polling and data transfer while keeping costs under control, ensuring that emergency notifications and system status are distributed without delay. Ensure robust security, especially for data flowing to the CAD system.

Rural Areas

Leverage a hybrid approach that uses LTE wherever possible to reduce polling delays and enable efficient data transfer, complemented by satellite or targeted P25 deployment for redundancy. This strategy maintains rapid alerting and system monitoring even in areas with less robust LTE coverage. Ensure robust security, especially for data flowing to the CAD system.

Coastal Regions

Deploy a hybrid system that integrates LTE for rapid polling and data transfer, with P25 and satellite acting as resilient backups. This configuration addresses the risks of coastal infrastructure damage and ensures emergency alerts and system status are delivered without delay. Ensure robust security, especially for data flowing to the CAD system.

Universal Best Practices

- **Cybersecurity:** Maintain robust security protocols, especially for data flowing to CAD systems, and plan for future upgrades to post-quantum cryptography.
- **System Testing:** Regularly test all components to ensure optimal performance and rapid response.
- **Interoperability:** Ensure seamless integration between agencies and technology platforms.
- **IoT Integration:** Incorporate IoT enhancements to enable real-time diagnostics and further reduce response times and provide more data to the CAD systems.

Formatted: Font: Bold

Formatted: Font: Bold

Formatted: Font: Bold

Conclusion

The need for immediate, reliable emergency alerts and system monitoring renders the extended polling times and limited data capabilities of pure P25 systems unacceptable for large-scale deployments. While P25 offers robustness and direct communication, its inherent delays when managing 100 to 500 towers and its limitations in providing data to CAD systems make it unsuitable as a primary technology in most emergency scenarios. Instead, LTE's rapid polling and data capabilities—supplemented by P25 and satellite for redundancy and targeted deployment options—provide a far more effective solution. A hybrid approach delivers the speed, cost efficiency, and resilience required to ensure communities are alerted and systems are monitored in seconds rather than minutes during a crisis.

About the Authors

Brian Nelson is the Founder and Principal Consultant of 911nurd, a public safety technology consulting firm focused on helping agencies navigate the complex and often chaotic world of 911 system modernization. With over 25 years of experience as a 911 System Administrator and technology strategist, Brian brings deep technical expertise and a realistic, boots-on-the-ground understanding of how public safety technology *should* work—but often doesn't.

Kenyon Langford is the Principal of 911nurd, a leading IT consulting firm specializing in public safety technology. With extensive experience in IT security, city management and public safety technology, he provides strategic guidance on cybersecurity, network modernization, and secure technology implementation. His expertise helps public safety agencies transition to next-generation, quantum-resistant security solutions.